Earnings in the U.S. Economy

Jim Spletzer
U.S. Census Bureau

LED Webinar
July 18, 2018
Disclaimer

Any opinions and conclusions expressed herein are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the U.S. Census Bureau.

All results have been reviewed to ensure that no confidential information is disclosed.
Goals of this Presentation

(1) Review publicly available earnings statistics from CES & QWI
   -- Discuss the similarities of the two series
   -- Discuss the tradeoff between timeliness versus detail

(2) Present some new LEHD earnings distribution statistics
   -- Show the increasing earnings distribution

(3) Discuss earnings trends during the past 20 years
   -- stagnation
   -- increasing inequality
Economic Data

- Employment and earnings are two of the most timely indicators of economic conditions
  - National estimates published by BLS first Friday of the month
  - State estimates published by BLS about two weeks later
  - Local area estimates published by BLS about two weeks after

- Mean earnings statistics provides information about:
  - Inflation monitoring
  - Tax revenue forecasts
  - Industry wage differentials, male-female wage differentials, returns to education, firm-size wage differentials, ...
1) Current Employment Statistics (CES) average real weekly earnings of production and non-supervisory workers

2) CES average real weekly earnings of all workers (available since 2006)

Both series downloaded from the BLS website (no manipulations)
QWI National Earnings, 1996 - 2017

1) Quarterly Workforce Indicators (QWI) real earnings of all workers, National

2) QWI real earnings of stable (full-quarter) workers, National

Both QWI series downloaded from the Census Bureau website, converted to weekly, seasonally adjusted, and converted to real
The CES All Workers and the QWI earnings series are very similar in levels and trends.
# Earnings Data: CES and QWI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CES</th>
<th>QWI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Timely (about one month lag)</td>
<td>2017:Q3 is most recent (2016:Q2 for National)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By industry</td>
<td>By industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By MSA (CES), by county (QCEW)</td>
<td>By county</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seasonally adjusted, Real</td>
<td>- - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- - -</td>
<td>By demographics (age, gender, education, race &amp; ethnicity)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- - -</td>
<td>By firm age and firm size</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
QWI Earnings by Demographics

Drill down from Gender to Gender * Age

SA Real FQ Earnings, 1993:Q1=100

Males Aged 25-34

Females Aged 25-34

SA Real FQ Earnings, 1993:Q1=100

Males Aged 45-54

Females Aged 45-54
Earnings by Firm Characteristics

SA Real FQ Earnings

SA Real FQ Earnings, 1993:Q1=100

Firm Size 0-19
Firm Size 20-49
Firm Size 50-249
Firm Size 250-499
Firm Size 500+
Earnings Data

The tradeoff between timeliness versus detail in publicly available earnings statistics:

-- Use CES data for timely statistics
-- Use QWI data for detailed statistics by demographics (age, gender, education, ...) and by firm age and firm size

The LEHD program is always looking to make the published QWI data more relevant and easier to use – any suggestions would be appreciated
The natural log of earnings is almost always distributed as a normal distribution.

Mean earnings (published by CES & QWI) is one possible summary statistic of this distribution.

Other summary statistics are the median (the 50th percentile), or the 10th and 90th percentiles.
Increasing inequality refers to a widening distribution of earnings (from red to blue).

Increasing inequality is often measured using:

-- the 10\textsuperscript{th} and 90\textsuperscript{th} percentiles

-- the amount of mass in the tails
Why do we care about increasing inequality?

1) “The rich getting richer, the poor getting poorer”

2) Economic growth is not being shared across the earnings distribution

Source: EPI
What do we know about increasing inequality?

CPS Real Earnings from bls.gov, SA 3QMA

Top 10% Income Share (Saez, 2016)
Published Earnings Distribution Statistics

1) Almost everything we know about increasing inequality in the U.S. comes from published CPS and IRS data
   -- Time series of 10th, 25th, 50th, 75th, and 90th percentiles from CPS
   -- Earnings shares of top 10%, top 5%, and top 1% from IRS
Published Earnings Distribution Statistics

1) Almost everything we know about increasing inequality in the U.S. comes from published CPS and IRS data
   -- Time series of 10\textsuperscript{th}, 25\textsuperscript{th}, 50\textsuperscript{th}, 75\textsuperscript{th}, and 90\textsuperscript{th} percentiles from CPS
   -- Earnings shares of top 10\%, top 5\%, and top 1\% from IRS
   -- Why not add LEHD statistics to the nation’s data infrastructure?

2) The LEHD can produce comprehensive earnings distribution statistics by demographics, by firm characteristics, and by geography
LEHD Research: Earnings Distribution Statistics

1) 1\textsuperscript{st}, 5\textsuperscript{th}, 10\textsuperscript{th}, 50\textsuperscript{th}, 90\textsuperscript{th}, 95\textsuperscript{th}, 99\textsuperscript{th} percentiles of earnings
   -- By Demographics, by Firm Characteristics, and by State

2) Share of earnings above 90\textsuperscript{th}, 95\textsuperscript{th}, 99\textsuperscript{th} percentiles
   -- By Demographics, by Firm Characteristics, and by State

Both of these statistics will allow us to observe:

[a] the distribution of earnings at a point in time
[b] how the distribution of earnings is moving over time
Quick technical point

❖ How can the LEHD program publish earnings percentiles? The median earnings (or the $10^{th}$ or $90^{th}$ percentile earnings) is the earnings of a given individual in the data, which is a disclosure.

❖ The median (and other percentiles) is “modeled” in the sense that we determine the $49\frac{1}{2}^{th}$ percentile and the $50\frac{1}{2}^{th}$ percentile in the data, and we re-define the median as the average of all observations between these two values.
A First Look at LEHD Earnings Distribution Statistics

❖ The following statistics use stable (full-quarter) earnings from 20 states with data from 1996:Q2 – 2015:Q3

-- Using full quarter jobs mimics the CPS-ORG earnings concept of usual weekly earnings of full time wage & salary workers at their main job

❖ All quarterly time series are in real terms, seasonally adjusted, and converted to weekly (÷13)
LEHD Earnings Distribution Statistics
LEHD Earnings Distribution Statistics

[Graph showing LEHD P10, LEHD P50, and LEHD P90 distributions from 1996 to 2015 with data points for each year.]
LEHD and CPS are similar but not identical
LEHD and CPS are similar but not identical
LEHD Earnings Distribution Statistics

LEHD P10
LEHD P50
LEHD P90
LEHD Mean

LEHD P10
LEHD P50
LEHD P90
LEHD Mean
LEHD Earnings Distribution Statistics

LEHD P10

LEHD P50

LEHD P90
LEHD Earnings Distribution Statistics
LEHD Earnings Distribution Statistics
LEHD Top Percentile Shares
(The amount of mass in the tails)

The highest earning 10% of individuals account for 41% of earnings

The highest earning 5% of individuals account for 29% of earnings

The highest earning 1% of individuals account for 13% of earnings
Summary

1) Earnings
   ➢ QWI earnings are very similar to published CES
   ➢ CES excellent for timeliness, QWI excellent for detail

2) Earnings Distribution Statistics
   ➢ LEHD research statistics show the widening earnings distribution
   ➢ Much more to do here (demographic, firm, geographic detail)

3) Earnings Trends in the U.S. Economy
   ➢ Median earnings stagnant from around 2000, with some evidence of growth in recent years
   ➢ Consistent widening of the earnings distribution during the past several decades, particularly at the top of the distribution
Comments appreciated

Jim Spletzer
James.R.Spletzer@census.gov
301-763-4069